



Effect of Essential Oils from *Nepeta crispa*, *Anethum graveolens* and *Satureja hortensis* Against the Stored-product Insect "*Ephestia kuehniella* (Zeller)"

Roghayeh Najafzadeh^{1*}, Somayyeh Ghasemzadeh² and Shahram Mirfakhraie³

¹Department of Medicinal Plants, Higher Education Center Shahid Baker Miyandoab, Urmia University, Iran

²Department of Plant Protection, Faculty of Agriculture, Urmia University, Urmia, Iran

³Department of Plant Protection, Faculty of Agriculture, Urmia University, Urmia, Iran

Article History: Received: 11 October 2018/Accepted in revised form: 08 June 2019

© 2012 Iranian Society of Medicinal Plants. All rights reserved.

Abstract

Essential oils of medicinal plants have insecticidal properties as bio pesticides. In this study fumigant effect of three plant essential oils extracted from *Nepeta crispa* Willd (Lamiaceae), *Satureja hortensis* L. (Lamiaceae) and *Anethum graveolens* L. (Apiaceae) were investigated against third instar larvae of the Mediterranean flour moth, *Ephestia kuehniella* Zeller (Pyralidae), during 2017 at Urmia University, Iran. Extraction of essential oils was carried out by hydrodistillation using a Clevenger-type apparatus. All of the essential oils were highly effective to *E. kuehniella* larvae. The highest mortalities produced by essential oil of *N. crispa* with LC₅₀ value of 6.846 $\mu\text{l L}^{-1}$ air followed by *A. graveolens* and *S. hortensis* with LC₅₀ values of 18.001 and 30.088 $\mu\text{l L}^{-1}$ air, respectively. There was a direct relationship between insecticidal activity and oils concentration. The results revealed that essential oils from the three aromatic plants have a potential insecticidal activity against the third larvae of the stored-product insect "Zeller" under laboratory conditions and might have paved an effective and friendly environmental treatment technique in Integrated Pest Management (IPM) programs.

Keywords: Medicinal plants, Bio pesticides, Insecticidal activity, *Ephestia kuehniella*

Introduction

Over the past decades, the stored products pests control measures have been one of the major tasks for conservators because the damage inflicted to foodstuff is irreversible. Several insect species pose a potential threat to variety of stored products [1]. The Mediterranean flour moth, *Ephestia kuehniella* Zeller (Lepidoptera: Pyralidae) is recognized as one of the most cosmopolitan pests attacking stored products and causes serious losses both in quantity through feeding damage and quality by contaminating the product with cast skin [2,3]. In Iran this pest habitats are flour and corn mills. Larvae reduce product quality by feeding. Apart from direct infestation of *E. kuehniella*, the faeces and webbings of larvae spoil the product [4].

According to earlier experiences, fumigants are commonly utilized for control of stored-products pests. Concerns about the development of insect resistance to phosphine have made the search for new alternatives imperative [5-8]. Natural insecticides such as essential oils would be applied as alternatives to conventional insecticides which are environmentally sustainable [9].

The genus *Nepeta* (Lamiaceae), with 280 species, is grown in Europe, Asia and a few parts of Africa [10]. Some of the species are used as traditional medicine for cancer, toothache, colds, anemia, headache, diarrhea, indigestion, tuberculosis, and other various ailments [11,12]. This genus contains 67 species in Iran [13]. Zhu *et al.* [14] and Ali *et al.* [15] stated essential oils of some species of *Nepeta* have insecticidal effect, but the review of the

*Corresponding author: Department of Medicinal Plants, Higher Education Center Shahid Bakeri Miyandoab, Urmia University, Iran, P. O. Box: 196
Email Address: r.najafzadeh@urmia.ac.ir

literature revealed the scarcity of information over the toxicity of *Nepeta crispa* Willd essential oil. The plants savory, *Satureja hortensis* L., belongs to the Lamiaceae family, has been used as medicinal herb anti-inflammatory properties [16]. Sahin *et al.* [17] reported antimicrobial properties of *S. hortensis*. Insecticidal activities of savory have been indicated [2,18]. *Anethum graveolens* L. (dill) (Apiaceae) is an annual medicinal plant vegetates in Middle East, Russia and Egypt [19]. The plant's seeds have a potent spicy odor and are therefore used as a seasoning agent in various foods. *Anethum* has sedative effect of intestinal spasms and griping, colic pain, liver diseases, etc. [20]. *A. graveolens* essential oil possesses varying degrees of insecticidal and antibacterial activities [21,22]. A large number of essential oils from herbal medicines have been demonstrated the insecticidal activity against a number of stored product insects [2,23,24]. Aslan *et al.* [25] reported insecticidal activity of essential oil of *N. racemosa* (Lamiaceae) on third instar larvae of *E. kuehniella*. Insecticidal effect of the essential oil from *S. hortensis* on *Lipaphis pseudobrassicae* Davis (Aphididae: Homoptera) has been documented [26].

Botanical insecticides are renewable, environment compatible and relatively safe enough to natural enemies [27]. The objective of this research was investigating the toxicity of essential oils of *N. crispa*, *S. hortensis* and *A. graveolens* against one of the most important stored-product insect "*E. kuehniella* (Zeller)".

Material and Methods

Rearing of Insects

The experiments were carried out at Department of Medicinal Plants, Higher Education Center Shahid Bakeri Miyandoab and Department of Plant Protection, Faculty of Agriculture, Urmia University, Iran, during 2017. The Mediterranean flour moth, *E. kuehniella*, was collected from the Department of Plant Protection. Stock cultures of *E. kuehniella* was established and maintained on a mixture of 600 g wheat flour containing 200 g yeast. The insects were kept in a temperature-controlled chamber with 25±5 °C and 65±5% R.H. and photoperiod of 14:8 (L:D) h.

Plant Material

Aerial parts of *Nepeta crispa*, *Satureja hortensis* and *Anethum graveolens* at flowering stages were harvested from the mountain areas of West-Azerbaijan province (Northwestern Iran) in a middle of August 2016. Plant materials were dried at room temperature and cut into small pieces. The essential oils were extracted from the samples using a Clevenger-type apparatus for 4 h. The obtained essential oil was maintained in a refrigerator at 4 °C for subsequent experiments. The essential oil was analyzed using GC/MS [28].

Determination of concentrations range

The appropriate range of essential oils concentrations was prepared in accordance with the procedure described by Moradeshaghi and Pourmirza [29] with some modifications. Based on standard dose fixing procedure preliminary bioassays were conducted with different doses. Mortality data from all bioassays were analyzed with SPSS software [30] and LD₂₅ and LD₇₅ were determined. Then, the logarithms of these concentrations were calculated and the logarithmic interval between doses was determined as follows;

$$d = \frac{X5 - X1}{n - 1}$$

d: logarithmic distance between two concentrations

X1: The logarithm of the concentration caused 25% of mortality

X5: The logarithm of the concentration caused 75% of mortality

n: The number of concentrations

The three concentrations between the first and fifth concentrations were calculated by estimating the logarithmic distance (d).

X2: The logarithm of the concentration of oil at logarithmic distance multiplied by one X2= X1+d

X3: The logarithm of the concentration of oil at logarithmic distance multiplied by two X3= X1+2d

X4: The logarithm of the concentration of oil at logarithmic distance multiplied by three X4= X1+3d

Next, the antilogarithms of these numbers were obtained and subsequently main concentrations were determined.

Bioassays

The fumigant toxicity assay of *N. crispa*, *S. hortensis* and *A. graveolens* essential oils conducted against *E. kuehniella*. Fumigation experiments carried out using the method of Aslan *et al.* [25] with some modifications. Ten third instar larvae of the insect were placed in the 100 ml

glass jars as experiment units. The jars were worn with muslin cloth for inhibition of larvae contact to filter paper [31]. The larvae of *E. kuehniella* were exposed to essential oil vapors (2.5, 3.98, 6.32, 10 and 16 $\mu\text{l L}^{-1}$ air for *N. crisper*, 17, 23.28, 31.91, 43.75 and 60 $\mu\text{l L}^{-1}$ for *S. hortensis* and 8, 11.95, 17.84, 26.65 and 40 $\mu\text{l L}^{-1}$ air for *A. graveolens*). The oils were pipetted onto filter paper (Whatman No.1) and appended to the under surface of the jar's lid. The mortality rate was recorded after 24 h and those insects that did not move when lightly probed or shaken in the mild heat were considered dead. Each treatment was replicated six times. The bioassay was performed at 25 ± 5 °C and $65 \pm 5\%$ R.H. and photoperiod of 14:8 (L:D) h. In each trial, the control groups were treated except that no essential oils were employed.

Data Analysis

Data were analyzed using ANOVA and treatment means were compared by Tukey's test at =0.05 level [30]. Probit analysis was conducted to estimate LC_{25} , LC_{50} , LC_{75} and LC_{95} values [32].

Results

GC/MS analysis of the essential oils of *N. crisper* showed that 1,8-Cineole (57.69%), Beta-pinene

(6.53%) and Alpha Terpineol (4.44%) were the predominant components. The components of Carvacrol (34.74%), Gamma-terpinene (34.27%) and Para-cymene (16.96%) in *S. hortensis* and the components of L-Phellandrene (34.19%), Carvone (23.67%), Limonene (21.47%), alpha-Terpineol (5.58%), and Para-cymene (5.50%) were the most abundant components in *A. graveolens* (Table 1).

Insecticidal activity of essential oils against *E. kuehniella* larvae

The results revealed that all essential oils had lethal effects to the tested insects. Probit analysis data ($P < 0.0001$) revealed that *N. crisper* essential oil ($LC_{50} = 6.846 \mu\text{l L}^{-1}$ air) possessed stronger fumigant toxicity against third instar larvae of *E. kuehniella* compared with those of essential oils of *A. graveolens* ($LC_{50} = 18.001 \mu\text{l L}^{-1}$ air) and *S. hortensis* ($LC_{50} = 30.088 \mu\text{l L}^{-1}$ air) (Table 2). In a bioassay of the essential oils of *N. crisper* ($F = 55.56$; $df = 4, 25$; $P < 0.001$), *S. hortensis* ($F = 56.24$; $df = 4, 25$; $P < 0.001$) and *A. graveolens* ($F = 59.44$; $df = 4, 25$; $P < 0.001$) against third instar larvae of *E. kuehniella* mortality varied significantly with increasing concentration of essential oils. Mortalities of the larvae were 89.7, 88.3 and 86.7 % after 24 h exposure to the highest concentrations of *N. crisper*, *S. hortensis* and *A. graveolens* essential oils, respectively (Table 3).

Table 1 Predominant the essential oils components of the studied plants

Medicinal Plant	Chemical group	Component	*RI	Composition %
<i>N. crisper</i>	Monoterpenoid	1,8-cineole	1032	57.69
<i>N. crisper</i>	Monoterpene	beta-pinene	978	6.53
<i>N. crisper</i>	Monoterpene	alpha terpineol	1192	4.44
<i>S. hortensis</i>	Monoterpenoid	carvacrol	1305	34.74
<i>S. hortensis</i>	Monoterpene	gamma-terpinene	1060	34.27
<i>S. hortensis</i>	Alkylbenzene related to a monoterpene	para-cymene	1025	16.96
<i>A. graveolens</i>	Monoterpene	l-phellandrene	1005	34.19
<i>A. graveolens</i>	Terpenoids	carvone	1249	23.67
<i>A. graveolens</i>	Monoterpene	limonene	1030	21.47
<i>A. graveolens</i>	Monoterpene	alpha-terpineol	1188	5.58
<i>A. graveolens</i>	Alkylbenzene related to a monoterpene	para-cymene	1025	5.50

*RI= Retention Index. **Table 2** Probit analysis data for *Nepeta crisper* Willd., *Satureja hortensis* L. and *Anethum graveolens* L. essential oils against the third instar larvae of *Ephesia kuehniella* Zeller

Essential oil	n	LC_{50} ($\mu\text{l L}^{-1}$)	*CI ($\mu\text{l L}^{-1}$)	LC_{95} ($\mu\text{l L}^{-1}$)	*CI ($\mu\text{l L}^{-1}$)	Slope \pm SE	** χ^2
<i>N. crisper</i>	10	6.846	6.004 7.845	26.427	20.037 40.052	2.803 \pm 0.331	0.616
<i>S. hortensis</i>	10	30.088	27.194 33.146	82.953	67.702 113.559	3.734 \pm 0.441	0.392
<i>A. graveolens</i>	10	18.001	15.94 20.342	62.888	48.694 93.026	3.029 \pm 0.35	0.537

* CI: confidential interval; ** χ^2 : chi-squared value

Table 3 Fumigant activity of *Nepeta crisper* Willd., *Satureja hortensis* L. and *Anethum graveolens* L. essential oils against the third instar larvae of *E. kuehniella*

Pest species	Concentration($\mu\text{L L}^{-1}$ air)	Mortality (%) mean \pm SE
<i>N. crispera</i>	2.5	11.7 \pm 3.07 a
	3.98	25.0 \pm 5.63a
	6.32	46.7 \pm 3.33b
	10	65.0 \pm 4.28c
	16	89.7 \pm 3.33d
<i>S. hortensis</i>	17	16.7 \pm 3.33 a
	23.28	36.7 \pm 3.33 b
	31.91	53.3 \pm 4.22 c
	43.75	70.0 \pm 2.58 d
	60	88.3 \pm 4.77 e
<i>A. graveolens</i>	8	13.3 \pm 2.11 a
	11.95	31.7 \pm 4.77 b
	17.84	50.0 \pm 2.58 c
	26.65	66.7 \pm 4.22 c
	40	86.7 \pm 4.22 d

Means within column with the same letter(s) are not significantly different ($P>0.05$) according to Tukey's test.

Discussion

Strong insecticidal activities of essential oils derived from many species of Lamiaceae and Apiaceae have been indicated on stored-product pests [36-39]. Lolestani and Shayesteh [40] investigated and showed relatively bioactivity of *Ziziphora clinopodioides* Lam. (Lamiaceae) and Chaubey *et al.* [33,37] reported insecticidal effect of *Trachyspermum ammi*, *Anethum graveolens* and *Cuminum cyminum* against stored product insects.

The insecticidal activity of essential oils depends on their chemical constituents, application rates, extension of exposure times and experimental conditions [41,42]. Monoterpenes exert toxic impact through different ways such as penetrating the insect body via the respiratory system (fumigant effect), cuticle (contact effect) or digestive system (ingestion effect) [43]. Sahaf *et al.* [28] stated that *Carum copticum* toxicity is related to its major components which are monoterpenoids. Monoterpenoids may act against insects on the nervous system, including c-aminobutyric acid (GABA)-gated chloride channels, acetylcholine esterase, sodium channels, octopamine receptors, tyramine receptors, nicotinic acetylcholine receptors (nAChR) and possibly other targets [44]. In this study, 1,8-cineole (57.69%), carvacrol (34.74%) and L-phellandrene (34.19%), were found to be the major constituent of *N. crispera*, *S.*

hortensis and *A. graveolens* respectively. Hence, high fumigant toxicity of the essential oils to *E. kuehniella* may be due to the presence of the monoterpenoids as a major constituent of them.

Based on the LC_{50} values, *N. crispera* was more toxic to the larvae compared to the other plants. Our results are in conformity with those of Plata-Rueda [45] who reported diallyl disulfide was more toxic than diallyl sulfide, principal constituents of *Allium sativum* L., for pupa of *Tenebrio molitor*. Slope value expresses rate of change in the mortality in relation to a unit change in concentration of toxicants [46,47]. According to our results, the steep slope of the dose-response line of *E. kuehniella* larvae exposed to *S. hortensis* indicated that a small increasing in essential oil concentration would cause substantial mortality which agrees with other similar studies [18,48].

The mortality rates for third instar larvae of *E. kuehniella* introduced to *N. crispera* were 89.7%. The toxic effect of *Nepeta* species have been showed against *Tribolium castaneum* [15]. Moderate to strong insecticidal activity have reported for *Nepeta* species [23]. 1,8-cineole (dominant composition of *Nepeta* oil) has been indicated as a toxic volatile against insect pests [41,49,50]. *S. hortensis* essential oil caused 88.3% mortality in *E. kuehniella* larvae. Heydarzade and Moravvej [18] indicated similar results who evaluated insecticidal effects of *Foeniculum vulgare* Mill., *Teucrium polium* L. and *S. hortensis* essential oils on

Callosobruchus maculatus. The essential oil of *S. hortensis* has been reported to possess high toxic effect against *E. kuehniella* and *Plodia interpunctella* [51]. Carvacrol and Thymol have been revealed as the major constituents of *S. hortensis* [18]. These compounds have been reported to possess toxic effects against agricultural, stored-product and medical arthropod pests [28,34,52]. The exposure of *E. kuehniella* larvae to essential oil of *A. graveolens* created 86.7 % mortality. Babri et al. [21] reported the toxic effect of *A. graveolens* against *Periplaneta americana*, *Musca domestica* and *Tribolium castaneum*. The fumigant activity of *A. graveolens* seed essential oil has been demonstrated against two stored product insects *T. confusum* and *C. maculatus* [53]. Carvone and limonene have been identified as the main components of *A. graveolens* [35,54]. Insecticidal activity of *A. graveolens* may be attributed to appreciable concentration of the composition [21,38,55]. Control of stored-products pest insects is essential wherever foodstuff quality is to be maintained. Plant products have been reported to possess insecticidal or deterrent activity against stored product pests [56].

Conclusion

According to our results, the essential oil of *N. crispa* was found to be the most effective against *E. kuehniella*. However the findings of this study revealed the fumigant activity of *N. crispa*, *S. hortensis* and *A. graveolens* essential oils to control *E. kuehniella* larvae that could be considered as potential agents which help to reduce stored-products insect populations in IPM programs. Nevertheless further studies are required to obtain toxicity data for other stored-product insects, the residues of the oils in food, flavor quality of food and persistence experiments.

Acknowledgements

We thank Department of Medicinal Plants, Higher Education Center Shahid Bakeri Miyandoab, and Department of Plant Protection, Faculty of Agriculture, Urmia University, Iran, for financial support and providing the facilities.

References

1. Ja Hyun NA, Ryoo ML. The influence of temperature on development of *Sitophilus oryzae* (Coleoptera: Curculionidae) on dried vegetable commodities. *J Stored Prod. Res.* 2002;36:125-129.
2. Ayvaz A, Sagdic O, Karabörklü S, Oztürk I. Insecticidal activity of the essential oils from different plants against three stored-product insects. *J Insect Sci.* 2010;10. Available online: insectscience.org/10.21.
3. Johnson JA, Valero KA, Hannel MM. Effect of low temperature storage on survival and reproduction of Indian meal moth (Lepidoptera: Pyralidae). *Crop Prot.* 1997;16:519-523.
4. Bagheri Zenouz A. Stored product pests and their control methods, Sepehr Publication Center, Tehran. 1996. (In Persian)
5. Collins PJ, Daghli GJ, Pavic H, Lambkin TM, Kopitke R, Bridgeman BW. Combating strong resistance to phosphine in stored grain pests in Australia. In: Wright EJ, Banks HJ, Highley E (eds.) *Stored grain in Australia 2000*, Proceedings of the Australian Postharvest Technical Conference. 2002;109-112.
6. Rajendran S, Sriranjini V. Plant products as fumigants for stored-product insect control. *J Stored Prod Res.* 2008;44:126-135.
7. Sokovic MD, Vukojevic J, Marin PD, Brkic DD, Vajs V, Van Griensven LJLD. Chemical composition of essential oils of *Thymus* and *Mentha* species and their antifungal activities. *Molecules.* 2009;14:238-249.
8. Taylor RWD. Phosphine-a major fumigant at risk. *Int Pest Control.* 1989;31:10-14.
9. Tripathi AK, Upadhyay S, Bhuiyan M, Bhattacharya PR. A review on the prospects of essential oils as biopesticides in insect pest-management. *J Pharmacognosy Phytother.* 2009;1:52-63.
10. Rechinger KH. Labiatae. In: Rechinger KH, Hedge IC, (eds.). *Flora Iranica*. Graz: Akademische Druck and Verlagsanstalt. 1982;108.
11. Duke JA, Ayensu ES. *Medicinal plants of China*. Ref. Publications, Algonac, MI. 1985;2:376.
12. Duke JA. *Handbook of medicinal herbs*, 2nd ed., p. 164-165. CRC Press. Boca Raton, FL. 2002.
13. Amin G. *Popular medicinal plants of Iran*. Tehran: Research Deputy of Health Ministry. 1991;1.
14. Zhu J, Zeng X, Yanma, Liu T, Qian K, Han Y, Xue S, Tucker B, Schultz G, Coats J, Rowley W, Zhang A. Adult repellency and larvicidal activity of five plant essential oils against mosquitoes. *J Am. Mosq Control Assoc.* 2006;22:515-522.
15. Ali A, Tabanca N, Demirci B, Blythe EK, Can Baser KH, Khan IA. Chemical composition and biological activity of essential oils from four *Nepeta* species and hybrids against *Aedes aegypti* (L.) (Diptera: Culicidae). *Rec. Nat. Prod.* 2016;10:137-147.
16. Zargari A. *Medicinal plants*. 4th ed. Tehran: Tehran University Publication. 1990;4.
17. Sahin F, Karaman I, Güllüce M, Öütçü H, Sengül M, Adigüzel A, Oztürk S, Kotan R. Evaluation of

- antimicrobial activities of *Satureja hortensis* L. J Ethnopharmacol. 2003;87:61-65.
18. Heydarzade A, Moravvej GhH. Contact toxicity and persistence of essential oils from *Foeniculum vulgare*, *Teucrium polium* and *Satureja hortensis* against *Callosobruchus maculatus* (Fabricius) (Coleoptera: Bruchidae) adults. Türk. entomol. Derg. 2012;36:507-518.
 19. Nasir E, Ali AI. Flora of West Pakistan, No. 20 Umbelliferae, Stewart Herbarium Gordon College Rawalpindi. 1972.
 20. Kaur GJ, Arora DS. Antibacterial and phytochemical screening of *Anethum graveolens*, *Foeniculum vulgare* and *Trachyspermum ammi*. BMC Complement. Altern. Med. 2009. Doi: 10.1186/1472-6882-9-30.
 21. Babri RA, Khokhar I, Mahmood Z, Mahmud S. Chemical composition and insecticidal activity of the essential oil of *Anethum graveolens* L. Sci. Int. 2012;24:453-455.
 22. Ruangamart A, Buranaphalin S, Temsiririrkkul R, Chuakul W, Pratuangdejkul J. Chemical compositions and antibacterial activity of essential oil from dill fruits (*Anethum graveolens* L.) cultivated in Thailand. Pharm. Sci. Asia. 2015;42:135-143.
 23. Ahmad N, Shinwari ZKH, Hussain J, Ahmad I. Insecticidal activities and phytochemical screening of crude extracts and its derived fractions from three medicinal plants *Nepeta leavigata*, *Nepeta kurramensis* and *Rhynchosia reniformis*. Pak J Bot. 2016;48:2485-2487.
 24. Ebadollahi A, Safaralizadeh MH, Hoseini SA, Ashouri S, Sharifian I. Insecticidal activity of essential oil of *Agastache foeniculum* against *Ephestia kuehniella* and *Plodia interpunctella* (Lepidoptera: Pyralidae). Mun Ent Zool. 2010;5:785-791.
 25. Aslan I, Çalma ur Ö, Sahin F, Çağlar Ö. Insecticidal effects of essential plant oils against *Ephestia kuehniella* (Zell.), *Lasioderma serricornis* (F.) and *Sitophilus granarius* (L.). J Plant Dis. Prot. 2005;112:257-267.
 26. Sampson BJ, Tabanca N, Kirimer N, Demirci B, Baser KHC, Khan IA, Spiers JM, Wedge DE. Insecticidal activity of 23 essential oils and their major compounds against adult *Lipaphis pseudobrassicae* (Davis) (Aphididae: Homoptera). Pest Manag Sci. 2005;61:1122-1128.
 27. Halder J, Srivastava C, Dureja P. Effect of methanolic extracts of periwinkle (*Vincarosea*) and bottlebrush (*Callistemon lanceolatus*) alone and their mixtures against neonate larvae of gram pod borer (*Helicoverpa armigera*). Indian J Agri Sci. 2010;80:820-823.
 28. Sahaf BZ, Moharrampour S, Meshkatsadat MH. Chemical constituents and fumigant toxicity of essential oil from *Carum copticum* against two stored product beetles. Insect Sci. 2007;14:213-218.
 29. Moradeshghi MJ, Pourmirza AA. Survey on the resistance of different stage of Mediterranean Flour Moth (*Plodia interpunctella*) to *Bacillus thuringiensis*. JESI. 1974;2:25-34. (In Persian)
 30. SPSS. IBM SPSS Statistics for Windows, Version 21.0. Armonk, NY: IBM Corp. 2012.
 31. Ziaee M, Moharrampour S, Mohsenifar A. Toxicity of *Carum copticum* essential oil-loaded nanogel against *Sitophilus granarius* and *Tribolium confusum*. J Applied Entomology. 2013. Doi: 10.1111/jen.12133.
 32. Abbott W. A method for computing the effectiveness of an insecticide. J Econ Entomol. 1925;18:265-267.
 33. Chaubey MK. Toxicity of essential oils from *Cuminum cyminum* (Umbelliferae), *Piper nigrum* (Piperaceae) and *Foeniculum vulgare* (Umbelliferae) against stored-product beetle *Tribolium castaneum* Herbst (Coleoptera: Tenebrionidae). EJEAFChe. 2006;34:1719-1727.
 34. Ahn YI, Lee SB, Lee HS, Kim GH. Insecticidal and acaricidal activity of carvacrol and (-)-thujaplicine derived from *Thujopsis dolabrata* var. *hondai* sawdust. J Chem Ecol. 1998;24:81-90.
 35. Chahal KK, Monika, Kumar A, Bhardwaj U, Kaur R. Chemistry and biological activities of *Anethum graveolens* L. (dill) essential oil: A review. J Pharmacognosy Phytother. 2017;6:295-306.
 36. Kim DH, Ahn YJ. Contact and fumigant activities of constituents of *Foeniculum vulgare* fruit against three coleopteran stored-product insects. Pest Manag Sci. 2001;57:301-306.
 37. Chaubey MK. Insecticidal activity of *Trachyspermum ammi* (Umbelliferae), *Anethum graveolens* (Umbelliferae) and *Nigella sativa* (Ranunculaceae) essential oils against stored-product beetle *Tribolium castaneum* Herbst (Coleoptera: Tenebrionidae). Afr J Agric Res. 2007;2:596-600.
 38. Eliopoulos PA, Hassiotis CN, Andreadis SS, Porichi AE. Fumigant toxicity of essential oils from basil and spearmint against two major pyralid pests of stored products. J. Econ. Entomol. 2015;108:805-810.
 39. Taghizadeh-Saroukolai A, Moharrampour S, Meshkatsadat MH. Insecticidal properties of *Thymus persicus* essential oil against *Tribolium castaneum* and *Sitophilus oryzae*. J Pest Sci. 2010;83:3-8.
 40. Lolestani FA, Shayesteh N. Fumigant toxicity of *Ziziphora clinopodioides* (Boiss.) (Lamiaceae) against adults and eggs of *Callosobruchus maculatus* (Fab.) (Coleoptera: Bruchidae). J Biotechnol Sci. 2009;9:92-95.
 41. Obeng-Ofori D, Reichmuth C, Bekele J, Hassanali A. Biological activity of 1,8-cineole, a major component of essential oil of *Ocimum kenyense* (Ayobangira) against stored products beetles. J. Appl. Entomol. 1997;121:237-243.
 42. Zekri N, Amalich S, Boughdad A, Alaoui El Belghiti M, Zair T. Phytochemical study and insecticidal activity of *Mentha pulegium* L. oils from Morocco against *Sitophilus Oryzae*. Mediterr. J. Chem. 2013;2:607-619.
 43. Prates HT, Santos JP, Waquil JM, Fabris JD, Oliveira AB, Foster JE. Insecticidal activity of monoterpenes against *Rhyzopertha dominica* (F.) and *Tribolium castanum* (Herbst). J Stored Prod Res. 1998;34:243-249.

44. Tong F. Investigation of mechanisms of action of monoterpenoid insecticides on insect gamma-aminobutyric acid receptors and nicotinic acetylcholine receptors. Graduate Theses and Dissertations. 2010. <https://doi.org/10.31274/etd-180810-48>.
45. Plata-Rueda A, Martínez LC, Santos MHD, Fernandes FL, Wilcken CF, Soares MA, Serrão JE, Zanuncio JC. Insecticidal activity of garlic essential oil and their constituents against the mealworm beetle, *Tenebrio molitor* Linnaeus (Coleoptera: Tenebrionidae). *Sci Rep* 2017. Doi: 10.1038/srep46406.
46. Robertson JL, Preisler HK. Pesticide Bioassays with Arthropods, CRC Press, Florida. 1992.
47. Tiwari S, Singh A. Piscicidal activity of alcoholic extract of *Nerium indicum* leaf and their biochemical stress response on fish metabolism. *AJTAM*. 2004;1:15-29.
48. Moazeni N, Khajealib J, Izadi H, Mahdian K. Chemical composition and bioactivity of *Thymus daenensis* Celak (Lamiaceae) essential oil against two lepidopteran stored-product insects. *J Essen Oil Res*. 2013. <http://dx.doi.org/10.1080/10412905.2013.860412>.
49. Kordali S, Aslan I, Calmasur O, Cadir A. Toxicity of essential oils isolated from three *Artemisia* species and some of their major components to granary weevil, *Sitophilus granaries* (L.) (Coleoptera: Curculionidae). *Ind. Crop Prod*. 2006;23:162-170.
50. Stamopoulos DC, Damos P, Karagianidou G. Bioactivity of five monoterpenoid vapours to *Tribolium confusum* (du Val) (Coleoptera: Tenebrionidae). *J Plant Prot Res*. 2007;43:571-577.
51. Mollaei N, Izadi H, Dashti H, Azizi M, Ranjbar-Karimi R. Bioactivity of essential oil from *Satureja hortensis* (Lamiaceae) against three stored-product insect species. *Afr. J. Biotechnol*. 2011;10:6620-6627.
52. Erler F. Fumigant activity of six monoterpenoids from aromatic plants in Turkey against the two stored product pests confused flour beetle, *Tribolium confusum*, and Mediterranean flour moth, *Ephestia kuehniella*. *J Plant Dis Prot*. 2005;112:602-611.
53. Khani A, Basavand F. Chemical composition and insecticide activity of essential oil from dill seeds. *IJARR*. 2013;3:489-494.
54. Said-Al Ahl H, Omer E. Essential oil content and chemical composition of eight dill (*Anethum graveolens* L.) cultivars cultivated under Egyptian conditions. *Int J Pharm Pharm. Sci*. 2016;8:227-231.
55. Rice PJ, Coats JR. Insecticidal properties of several monoterpenoids to the house fly (Diptera: Muscidae), red flour beetle (Coleoptera: Tenebrionidae), and southern corn rootworm (Coleoptera: Chrysomelidae). *J Econ Entomol*. 1994;87:1172-1179.
56. Dales MJ. A review of plant material used for controlling insect pests of stored products. *NRI Bulletin*, 1996. Available in: <http://gala.gre.ac.uk/10738>.